

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

REGION 4
ATLANTA FEDERAL CENTER
61 FORSYTH STREET
ATLANTA, GEORGIA 30303-8960

FEB 2 5 2010

Certified Mail - Return Receipt Requested

Mr. Rich Halsey Vice President, Quality Assurance Changing Paradigms, LLC 4 Sandbank Road Ludlow, Kentucky 41016

RE: Docket No. FIFRA-04-2010-3011(b); Changing Paradigms, LLC

Dear Mr. Halsey:

Enclosed is a copy of the ratified Consent Agreement and Final Order (CAFO) in the above-referenced matter. The original CAFO has been filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk and served on the parties as directed in Section 22.6 of the Consolidated Rules of Practice, 40 C.F.R. Part 22.

As stated in Section IV of the CAFO, the assessed penalty of \$880 is due within 30 days from the effective date. Please ensure that the face of your cashier's or certified check includes the name of the company and the docket number of this case. Penalty payment questions should be directed to Ms. Lori Weidner either by telephone at (513) 487-2125 or by written correspondence to her attention at the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency's (EPA's) Cincinnati Accounting Operations address identified in the CAFO. Should you have any questions about this matter or your compliance status in the future, please call me at (404) 562-8979 or Ms. Mary Summers at (404) 562-8997.

Also enclosed is a copy of a document entitled "Notice of Securities and Exchange Commission Registrants' Duty to Disclose Environmental Legal Proceedings." This document puts you on notice of your potential duty to disclose to the Securities and Exchange Commission (SEC) any environmental enforcement actions taken by EPA.

Sincerely.

Jeaneanne M. Gettle

Chief

Pesticides and Toxic Substances Branch

Enclosures

cc: State Lead Agency

Internet Address (URL) • http://www.epa.gov
Recycled/Recyclable • Printed with Vegetable Off Based Inks on Recycled Paper (Minimum 30% Postconsumer)

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY ATLANTA, GEORGIA

In the Matter of:)	Docket No. FIFRA-04-2010-3011(b)	2910	
Changing Paradigms, LLC)		FEB 2	
Respondent.)))		5 PM 1:	Domes of
		<u></u>	N.	

CONSENT AGREEMENT AND FINAL ORDER

I. Nature of the Action

- 1. This is a civil penalty proceeding pursuant to the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act, as amended, 7 U.S.C. §§136 et seq. (hereinafter "FIFRA"), and pursuant to the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties and the Revocation/Termination or Suspension of Permits (Consolidated Rules), 40 C.F.R. Part 22. Complainant is the Director of the Air, Pesticides and Toxics Management Division, United States Environmental Protection Agency, Region 4 (EPA). Respondent is Changing Paradigms, LLC.
- 2. Complainant and Respondent have conferred for the purpose of settlement pursuant to 40 C.F.R. §22.18 and desire to resolve this matter and settle the allegations described herein without a formal hearing. Therefore, without the taking of any evidence or testimony, the making of any argument, or the adjudication of any issue in this matter, and in accordance with 40 C.F.R. §22.13(b), this Consent Agreement and Final Order (CAFO) will simultaneously commence and conclude this matter.

II. Preliminary Statements

- 3. The authority to take action under Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §136l(a), is vested in the Administrator of EPA. The Administrator of EPA has delegated this authority under FIFRA to the Regional Administrators by EPA Delegation 5-14, dated May 11, 1994.
- 4. Pursuant to 40 C.F.R. §22.5(c)(4) the following individual represents EPA in this matter and is authorized to receive service for EPA in this proceeding:

Mary Summers
Case Development Officer
U.S. EPA Region 4
61 Forsyth Street, SW
Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960.

- Respondent is Changing Paradigms, LLC, a Kentucky corporation, located at 4 Sandbank
 Road, Ludlow, Kentucky 41016.
- 6. Respondent is a "person" as defined by Section 2(s) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §136(s), and as such is subject to FIFRA and the regulations promulgated thereunder.
- 7. Respondent is a "producer" as defined by Section 2(w) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §136(w), and 40 C.F.R. §167.3.
- 8. Respondent's establishment located at 4 Sandbank Road, Ludlow, Kentucky, is registered with the Agency as a pesticide-producing establishment.
- 9. Respondent's EPA Establishment Number is 072064-KY-001.

III. EPA's Statement of Facts and Allegations of Violation

- 10. Producers operating an establishment registered with EPA are required to submit to the Administrator of EPA an annual report which indicates the types and amounts of pesticides or active ingredients which they are currently producing, which they produced during the past year, and which they sold or distributed during the past year, pursuant to Section 7(c)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §136e(c)(1), and the regulations promulgated at 40 C.F.R. §167.85.
- 11. Submittal of the annual report of pesticide-production for calendar year 2008 was due on or before March 1, 2009.
- 12. Respondent failed to submit the annual report on or before March 1, 2009.
- 13. Therefore, Respondent violated Section 12(a)(2)(L) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §136j(a)(2)(L).
- 14. Section 14(a) of the Debt Collection Improvement Act of 1966, authorizes EPA to assess a civil penalty for violations of FIFRA.
- 15. Section 14(a)(4) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §136*l*(a), requires EPA to consider the appropriateness of the assessed penalty to the size of business of the Respondent, the effect on Respondent's ability to continue in business, and the gravity of the violation.
- 16. EPA proposes to assess a total civil penalty of EIGHT HUNDRED, EIGHTY DOLLARS (\$880) against the Respondent for the above-described violation. Civil penalties under Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §136l(a), may be assessed by Administrative Order.

IV. Consent Agreement

- 17. For the purposes of this CAFO, Respondent admits the jurisdictional allegations set forth above, but neither admits nor denies EPA's allegations of violations, set forth above.
- 18. Respondent waives its right to a hearing on the allegations contained herein and its right to appeal the proposed final order accompanying the consent agreement.
- 19. Respondent consents to the assessment of and agrees to pay the civil penalty as set forth in this CAFO.
- 20. Respondent certifies that as of the date of its execution of this CAFO, it is in compliance with all relevant requirements of FIFRA.
- Respondent agrees to submit to EPA all future annual pesticide-production reports required under Section 7 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §136(e), on or before the March 1st due date. Respondent shall send the reports by means of certified mail, return receipt requested, to the following address:

U.S. EPA – Region 4

Sam Nunn Atlanta Federal Center

Chemical Products & Asbestos Section

61 Forsyth Street SW

Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960.

22. Compliance with this CAFO shall resolve the allegation of the violation contained herein.
This CAFO shall not otherwise affect any liability of Respondent to the United States.
Other than as expressed herein, neither EPA nor Complainant waives any right to bring

an enforcement action against Respondent for violation of any federal or state statute, regulation or permit, to initiate an action for imminent and substantial endangerment, or to pursue criminal enforcement.

23. Complainant and Respondent agree to settle this matter by their execution of this CAFO.
The parties agree that the settlement of this matter is in the public interest and that this
CAFO is consistent with the applicable requirements of FIFRA.

V. Final Order

- 24. Respondent shall pay a civil penalty of EIGHT HUNDRED, EIGHTY DOLLARS

 DOLLARS (\$880) for the violations alleged in Section III of this CAFO.
- 25. Payment shall be made within 30 days from the date that this CAFO is filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk.
- 26. Respondent shall pay the penalty by forwarding a cashier's or certified check, payable to the "Treasurer, United States of America," to the following address:

US Environmental Protection Agency Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center PO Box 979077 St. Louis, MO 63197-9000.

The check shall reference on its face "Docket No. FIFRA-04-2010-3011(b)."

27. At the time of payment, Respondent shall send a separate copy of the check and a written statement that the payment is being made in accordance with this CAFO, to the following persons at the following addresses:

Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. EPA - Region 4 Sam Nunn Atlanta Federal Center 61 Forsyth Street Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960

Mary Summers
Case Development Officer
U.S. EPA - Region 4
Sam Nunn Atlanta Federal Center
61 Forsyth Street
Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960

and

Saundi Wilson
Office of Environmental Accountability
U.S. EPA - Region 4
Sam Nunn Atlanta Federal Center
61 Forsyth Street
Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960.

- 28. For the purposes of state and federal income taxation, Respondent shall not be entitled, and agrees not to attempt, to claim a deduction for any civil penalty payment made pursuant to this CAFO. Any attempt by Respondent to deduct any such payments shall constitute a violation of this CAFO.
- 29. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. §3717, EPA is entitled to assess interest and penalties on debts owed to the United States and a charge to cover the cost of processing and handling a delinquent claim. Interest will therefore begin to accrue on the civil penalty from the date

of entry of this CAFO, if the penalty is not paid by the date required. A charge will also be assessed to cover the administrative costs, both direct and indirect, of overdue debts. In addition, a late payment penalty charge shall be applied on any principle amount not paid within 90 days of the due date.

- 30. Complainant and Respondent shall bear their own costs and attorney fees in this matter.
- 31. This CAFO shall be binding upon the Respondent, its successors and assigns.
- 32. Each undersigned representative of the parties to this CAFO certifies that he or she is fully authorized by the party represented to enter into this CAFO and legally bind that party to this CAFO.

VI. Effective Date

33. The effective date of this CAFO shall be the date on which the CAFO is filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk.

AGREED AND CONSENTED TO:

Regional Judicial Officer

Changing Paradigms, LLC	
By: Auful Halsey Name: Richard Halsey Title: VP, Quality Assarance	Date: 01/20/10
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency	
By: William	Date: 2/10/10
Kenneth R. Lapierre, Acting Director	
Air, Pesticides and Toxics	•
Management Division	
61 Forsyth Street	
Atlanta, Georgia 30303-8960	
APPROVED AND SO ORDERED this /8 day o	Jeb , 2010.
Susan B. Schub	

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the date set out below, I filed the original and one copy of the foregoing Consent Agreement and Final Order and served a true and correct copy of the foregoing Consent Agreement and Final Order, In the Matter of Changing Paradigms, LLC, FIFRA Docket Number: 04-2010-3011(b), to the addressees listed below.

Mr. Rich Halsey Vice President, Quality Assurance Changing Paradigms, LLC 4 Sandbank Road Ludlow, Kentucky 41016 (Via Certified Mail, Return Receipt Requested)

Mary Summers PCPMS U.S. EPA Region 4 61 Forsyth Street, S.W. Atlanta, GA 30303

(Via EPA's internal mail)

Robert Caplan
Office of Environmental Accountability
U.S. EPA Region 4
61 Forsyth Street, S.W.
Atlanta, GA 30303

(Via EPA's internal mail)

Date: $\sqrt{35}$

Patricia A. Bullock, Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 4 Atlanta Federal Center

61 Forsyth St., SW Atlanta, GA 30303 (404) 562-9511

EPA ACCOUNTS RECEIVABLE CONTROL NUMBER FORM

TO BE CO	MPLETED BY THE ORIGINATING a copy of the final order and transmittal le	OFFICI	<u>E</u> : fendent/D	ecnondant)		
•		tter to be	contrastic be	coporacia,		2/4/10
This form w	as originated by:	(N	ame)		on _	(Date)
in the	Region 4, ORC, OÉA	•			at (404	l) 562 ÷9504
<u></u>	(Office) ,	$\overline{}$			bone Number)
	on-SF Judicial Order/Consent Decree SAO COLLECTS			Administrative Order FMO COLLECTS PA		
I	F Judicial Order/Consent Decree OJ COLLECTS			Oversight Billing - Co Sent with bill Not sent with bill	st Packa	ge required:
o	ther Receivable			Oversight Billing - Co	st Packa	ge not required
т	nis is an original debt			This is a modification		
PAYEE:_	Changing Paradism	25 (1			_	
	(Name of person and/or C	ompany/M	1 weicipalii 	y making the payment)		
The Total [Oollar Amount of the Receivable: \$	10/	- 4 4	San Jan Jahan Gan Onla		48.7.7.
The Case D	ocket Number: FIFRA OY		-			_
	ecific Superfund Account Number:					
The Design	ated Regional/Headquarters Program Offic	: 				
				<u>`</u> ;		
The IFMS	Accounts Receivable Control Number is:			D	ate	
If you have	any questions, please call:	_ of the	Financial i	Management Section at:	<u> </u>	
DISTRIBUT	TON:			-		<u>.</u>
	AL ORDERS: Copies of this form with an attact se mailed to:	ed copy of	the front pa	age of the FINAL JUDICIA	AL ORDI	<u>er</u>
E D P	ebt Tracking Officer nviroumental Enforcement Section epartment of Justice RM 1647 O. Box 7611, Benjamin Franklin Station Vashington, D.C. 20044	2. 3.		ng Office (EAD) d Program Office		
B. ADMIN	ISTRATIVE ORDERS: Copies of this form with	h an attach	ed copy of t	he front page of the Admir	ustrative	Order should be to:
ı. · <u>c</u>	originating Office	3.	Designate	ed Program Office		